

**NC Capital Area MPO  
CMAQ Project Selection Subcommittee  
September 24, 2009**

**Attendees:**

Candace Davis, Town of Wake Forest  
Michele Hane, Town of Morrisville  
Fleming El-Amin, City of Raleigh  
Jonathan Parker, Triangle Transit  
Scottie Wilkins, City of Creedmoor  
Bill Barlow, NCDOT PTD  
Eric Simpson, Town of Cary  
Aditya Ramachandran, NCSU  
Brian O'Sullivan, NCSU  
Danny Johnson, Town of Fuquay-Varina  
John Hodges-Copple, Triangle J COG  
Chris Hills, Town of Knightdale  
David Eatman, Capital Area Transit  
Chip Russell, Town of Wake Forest  
Mike Kennon, City of Raleigh  
Doug McRaney, Town of Cary  
Sandi Bailey, Town of Cary  
Reed Huegerich, Town of Apex

**CAMPO Staff Present:**

Ed Johnson  
Diane Wilson  
Kenneth Withrow  
Kyle Ward  
Shelby Powell

The TCC's CMAQ subcommittee met on August 26, 2009, and had decided to extend the deadline for CMAQ application submissions due to the small number of projects received under the original deadline, and the extension of the NCDOT's deadline for submitting CMAQ projects to the state. The CMAQ Project Selection Subcommittee met on September 24 to review and rank submittals and prepare a recommendation to the TCC regarding which projects should be funded with the Capital Area MPO (CAMPO) allocation in the 2011-2017 TIP.

Staff presented a brief overview of the projects submitted; there were nine bicycle and pedestrian, two intersection, one TDM t, five transit, and three ITS projects. CAMPO staff prepared a list of an additional 14 potential projects for consideration by the committee.

CAMPO staff outlined the methods used to standardize the bicycle and pedestrian project technical calculations, i.e. using a 1.5% ADT reduction on a parallel route as the basis for

standardized emissions reductions. Also staff reported that the emissions calculations for the various other types of projects had been reviewed and deemed appropriate for use in comparison. All emissions reduction numbers were put into comparable units of:

- grams of pollutant reduction per day,
- grams of pollutant reduction per thousand dollars,
- grams of pollutant reduction over the expected life of the project,
- dollars paid per kilogram of pollutant reduced over the expected life of the project, and
- total NOX reduced over the expected life of the project.

The committee discussed the merits of the various technical information presented by staff, geographic equity in project distribution. The consensus was that selection should include a range of project types and locations, and that emissions benefits should be part of the conversation, but not necessarily the deciding factor.

The group reviewed the methodology used by the Mecklenburg-Union MPO for prioritizing CMAQ projects. CAMPO staff reviewed the points awarded in the MUMPO methodology, and suggested various changes for use in the CAMPO area. A draft rating sheet was distributed showing how projects would have scored using the MUMPO method. The group briefly discussed the point categories in the MUMPO methodology, and agreed to use it as a starting point for developing a CAMPO methodology, but the consensus was that there was not enough time to prepare a full prioritization methodology during this meeting. Also, several members noted that it would be unfair to apply a prioritization methodology after projects were submitted, since this information could have influenced local decisions about project requests. The group decided to move forward with a non-technical rank of projects while still considering technical merits as decisions were made. The committee further agreed to continue working toward an official prioritization methodology that could be used in future CMAQ calls.

Chip Russell suggested that each entity who had applied for a project under the initial deadline should receive one project in order to be fair to those applicants who had submitted projects under the original deadline. This resulted in the following list of projects:

- Raleigh Bike Lane Striping
- Cary Crabtree Creek Greenway segment
- Morrisville Crabtree Creek Greenway segment
- Wake Forest Smith and Sanford Creek Greenway and Sidewalk project
- Creedmoor NC 56 East Greenway
- Apex Old Raleigh Road Sidewalk project
- Triangle J Council of Governments TDM regional project
- CAT bus replacement project

Motion made by Danny Johnson to award funds to these projects first was seconded by Chris Hills. This motion carried with one opposing vote. This resulted in approximately \$16.7 million of CMAQ funding being allocated to those projects.

Chip Russell suggested that applicants with projects left unfunded after the first “round” choose their top project priority to see if dollars would be available for the group to fund all second-choice projects. Chris Hills made this effective through a motion, which was seconded by John Hodges-Copple. The list that resulted from that exercise was:

- Raleigh Six Forks Road Sidewalk project
- Creedmoor 56 West Greenway
- Cary Single Quadrant Intersection project at High House Road
- Knightdale Boulevard Turn Lane project
- CAMPO I-440 Ramp Metering project
- NCSU Centennial Campus Park and Ride Lot
- Triangle Transit Holly Springs expansion service including two park and ride lots and operations assistance for three years

This list resulted in an additional \$7.7 million dollars worth of CMAQ projects.

The group reviewed the projects selected and discussed the air quality benefits of those on the second list. A discussion ensued regarding the merits of these projects versus other projects on the list. Consensus of the group was that the projects selected represented a good mix of project types and locations. In reviewing the emissions reduction benefits, almost all projects were in the top half of the range of emissions reductions for their project types.

Motion was made by Chris Hills, seconded by Michele Hane, to direct funding toward this list of projects. This motion carried with one opposing vote.

The actions left four projects that had been applied for unfunded: Raleigh I-40 Overpass Pedestrian Improvement Study & Implementation; Raleigh Parking Guidance System; Triangle Transit Multiple Park & Ride Lot project; and Triangle Transit Fuquay-Varina Service Expansion and Park & Ride Lot.

The group agreed to continue working on creating an official methodology to prioritize CMAQ projects for future funding calls.